



Community Insights in Phylogenetic HIV Research: The CIPHR Project Protocol

François Cholette, Lisa Lazarus, Pascal Macharia, Laura H. Thompson, Samuel Githaiga, John Mathenge, Jeffrey Walimbwa, Irene Kuria, Silvia Okoth, Solomon Wambua, Harrison Albert, Peninah Mwangi, Joyce Adhiambo, Rosemary Kasiba, Esther Juma, Parinita Battacharjee, Joshua Kimani, Paul Sandstrom, Adrienne F. A. Meyers, Jeffrey B. Joy, Matthew Thomann, Paul J. McLaren, Souradet Shaw, Sharmistha Mishra, Marissa L. Becker, Lyle McKinnon & Robert Lorway

To cite this article: François Cholette, Lisa Lazarus, Pascal Macharia, Laura H. Thompson, Samuel Githaiga, John Mathenge, Jeffrey Walimbwa, Irene Kuria, Silvia Okoth, Solomon Wambua, Harrison Albert, Peninah Mwangi, Joyce Adhiambo, Rosemary Kasiba, Esther Juma, Parinita Battacharjee, Joshua Kimani, Paul Sandstrom, Adrienne F. A. Meyers, Jeffrey B. Joy, Matthew Thomann, Paul J. McLaren, Souradet Shaw, Sharmistha Mishra, Marissa L. Becker, Lyle McKinnon & Robert Lorway (2023) Community Insights in Phylogenetic HIV Research: The CIPHR Project Protocol, *Global Public Health*, 18:1, 2269435, DOI: [10.1080/17441692.2023.2269435](https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2023.2269435)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2023.2269435>



© 2023 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group



Published online: 18 Oct 2023.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 475



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)



Community Insights in Phylogenetic HIV Research: The CIPHR Project Protocol

François Cholette^{a,b,*}, Lisa Lazarus^{c,*}, Pascal Macharia^d, Laura H. Thompson^e, Samuel Githaiga^d, John Mathenge^d, Jeffrey Walimbwa^{f,g}, Irene Kuria^h, Silvia Okothⁱ, Solomon Wambua^h, Harrison Albert^d, Peninah Mwangiⁱ, Joyce Adhiambo^{j,k}, Rosemary Kasiba^l, Esther Juma^k, Parinita Battacharjee^l, Joshua Kimani^{k,m}, Paul Sandstrom^{a,b}, Adrienne F. A. Meyers^{a,b}, Jeffrey B. Joy^{n,o,p}, Matthew Thomann^q, Paul J. McLaren^{a,b}, Souradet Shaw^c, Sharmistha Mishra^{r,s,t,u}, Marissa L. Becker^c, Lyle McKinnon^{a,m,v} and Robert Lorway^c

^aDepartment of Medical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Canada; ^bSexually Transmitted and Blood-Borne Infections, National Microbiology Laboratory at JC Wilt Infectious Diseases Research Centre, Public Health Agency of Canada, Winnipeg, Canada; ^cInstitute for Global Public Health, Department of Community Health Sciences, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Canada; ^dHealth Options for Young Men on HIV/AIDS and STIs (HOYMAS), Nairobi, Kenya; ^eSexually Transmitted and Blood-Borne Infections Surveillance Division, Centre for Communicable Diseases and Infection Control, Public Health Agency of Canada, Ottawa, Canada; ^fIshtar MSM, Nairobi, Kenya; ^gG10 Research Network, Nairobi, Kenya; ^hKey Population Consortium of Kenya, Nairobi, Kenya; ⁱBar Hostess Empowerment and Support Programme, Nairobi, Kenya; ^jPartners for Health Development in Africa (PHDA), Nairobi, Kenya; ^kSex Worker Outreach Programme (SWOP), Nairobi, Kenya; ^lSWOP Ambassadors, Nairobi, Kenya; ^mDepartment of Medical Microbiology, University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya; ⁿBritish Columbia Centre for Excellence in HIV/AIDS (BCCfE), St. Paul's Hospital, Vancouver, Canada; ^oDivision of Infectious Diseases, Department of Medicine, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada; ^pBioinformatics Programme, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada; ^qDepartment of Anthropology, University of Maryland, College Park, MD, USA; ^rMAP Centre for Urban Health Solutions, St. Michael's Hospital, Toronto, Canada; ^sDepartment of Medicine, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada; ^tInstitute of Medical Sciences, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada; ^uInstitute of Health Policy, Management and Evaluation, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada; ^vCentre for the AIDS Programme of Research in South Africa, Durban, South Africa

ABSTRACT

Inferring HIV transmission networks from HIV sequences is gaining popularity in the field of HIV molecular epidemiology. However, HIV sequences are often analyzed at distance from those affected by HIV epidemics, namely without the involvement of communities most affected by HIV. These remote analyses often mean that knowledge is generated in absence of lived experiences and socio-economic realities that could inform the ethical application of network-derived information in 'real world' programmes. Procedures to engage communities are noticeably absent from the HIV molecular epidemiology literature. Here we present our team's protocol for engaging community activists living in Nairobi, Kenya in a knowledge exchange process – The CIPHR Project (Community Insights in Phylogenetic HIV Research). Drawing upon a community-based participatory approach, our team will (1) explore the possibilities and

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 1 March 2023
Accepted 4 October 2023

KEYWORDS

Molecular HIV surveillance; phylogenetics; participatory research; data justice; behavioural and biological survey

CONTACT François Cholette  cholettf@myumanitoba.ca  Department of Medical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases, University of Manitoba, 745 Logan Avenue, Winnipeg, MB R3E 3L5, Canada  +1 (343) 597-1649

*These authors contributed equally to this work.

© 2023 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group
This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits unrestricted non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. The terms on which this article has been published allow the posting of the Accepted Manuscript in a repository by the author(s) or with their consent.

limitations of HIV molecular epidemiology for key population programmes, (2) pilot a community-based HIV molecular study, and (3) co-develop policy guidelines on conducting ethically safe HIV molecular epidemiology. Critical dialogue with activist communities will offer insight into the potential uses and abuses of using such information to sharpen HIV prevention programmes. The outcome of this process holds importance to the development of policy frameworks that will guide the next generation of the global response.

Background

HIV genomic sequencing is now a routine standard of clinical care to detect anti-retroviral drug resistance mutations (Wensing et al., 2019), but recent advances in computational biology and phylogenetics offer novel approaches to understanding HIV transmission (Brenner et al., 2021; McLaughlin et al., 2021; Nduva et al., 2021; Ratmann et al., 2019). While this provides new opportunities for ‘precision public health’ (Arnold, 2022; Buckeridge, 2020; Khoury et al., 2018; Miller et al., 2022; Rasmussen et al., 2020), reconstructing the genetic relationship of HIV sequences and, by extension, links between individual people holds major implications for marginalised populations who already disproportionately experience stigma and criminalisation globally (Molldrem & Smith, 2020).

In an African context, where gay, bisexual and other men who have sex with men [gbMSM; including male sex workers (MSW)] and female sex workers (FSW) endure regular forms of discrimination (Risher et al., 2013; Wanjiru et al., 2022), attending to unintended consequences of phylogenetic analyses is especially salient. Many African countries continue to uphold colonial-era sodomy laws criminalising consensual sex between men (Matetola-Mohapi, 2021), while FSW face criminalisation and regular harassment at the hands of police throughout the continent (Mbote et al., 2022). Therefore, *how* research findings portray these groups of people when describing trends in HIV transmission raises critical issues that go well beyond ‘the molecular’, given that outputs from phylogenetic analyses (for example, quantifying rates of HIV flow between places or populations) can perpetuate harm to these and other marginalised communities (Hoppe et al., 2022; Park et al., 2021). This can be especially damaging when the findings from phylogenetic studies reach the public domain and are misinterpreted by law enforcement, journalists, and lay audiences.

For instance, a recent article in the UK-based newspaper *The Star* (21 April 2022, Nairobi) entitled ‘Worrying Trend: HIV Infections Among Gays are From the Coast – Scientists (*sic*)’ was based on findings from a phylogenetic analysis by Nduva et al., with members of our team, François Cholette, Paul Sandstrom, and Lyle McKinnon, as co-authors on the study (Muchangi, 2022; Nduva et al., 2022a). The *Star* article strongly implied that MSM were responsible for spreading HIV from Nyanza to Nairobi since ‘*MSM from Nairobi visit the Coast for domestic and sex tourism, pick [up] the virus, and spread it upon return*’. Such a portrayal reinforces and perpetuates reductive stereotypes of gay men as ‘vectors of disease’ that are highly stigmatising against the wider backdrop of anti-homosexuality laws, religious and political vilification, and the criminalisation of HIV transmission in the region (Eba, 2015; Parsitau, 2021). While journalists may occasionally make erroneous and over-simplified claims about scientific studies, it is equally important for scientists to acknowledge their responsibility in reflecting on how data is presented and how it could potentially be misrepresented. As members of the CIPHR Project (Community Insights in Phylogenetic HIV Research) – a team comprised of natural scientists, public health specialists, social scientists, and Kenyan community activists – we aim to highlight a critical dialogue and knowledge exchange process we began around our involvement in phylogenetic studies, while reflecting on the broader benefits and pitfalls of deploying HIV molecular epidemiology for key population prevention programmes in Nairobi, Kenya. These conversations are both timely and relevant since many of the

issues raised concerning HIV molecular epidemiology risk being repeated while responding to the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) pandemic and more recent Monkeypox virus (Mpox) outbreaks (Molldrem et al., 2021).

Understanding patterns of HIV transmission

Molecular epidemiology represents the unification of pathogen sequence analysis (i.e. phylogenetics) and sociodemographic, behavioural, and geographical information (Riley & Blanton, 2018). Increasingly it is being used in precision public health to better understand transmission dynamics and target interventions for populations (Han et al., 2020; Isidro et al., 2022; Poon et al., 2016; Wang et al., 2015; Worobey et al., 2016; Worobey et al., 2020). Molecular epidemiology is particularly impactful in contributing to our understanding of HIV transmission dynamics due to the virus' rapid rate of evolution, resulting in viral progeny virtually unique to the host (Holmes, 2009; Zanini et al., 2015). A high degree of similarity between two or more HIV sequences would therefore suggest that they originate from the same transmission network (Poon et al., 2015). Recent methods in computational biology provide more reliable estimates of the timing and directionality of transmission (i.e. '*who infected who and when*') by exploiting next generation sequencing (NGS) data (Puller et al., 2017; Ratmann et al., 2019; Ratmann et al., 2020; Wymant et al., 2018). This could be used to shed light on HIV transmission patterns which may be otherwise difficult to ascertain using standard survey-based approaches, especially if we consider that many individuals may be reluctant to reveal personal information such as past sexual and drug injecting behaviours (Gnambs & Kaspar, 2014). For example, phylogenetics played a significant role in the Undetectable Equals Untransmissible (U = U) movement by showing that sexual transmission of HIV in sero-discordant couples did not occur when the partner living with HIV was virally suppressed (Cohen et al., 2011; Rodger et al., 2016; Rodger et al., 2019; Zhang et al., 2021). The U = U movement has several significant implications such as: (1) promoting the use of HIV treatment as a prevention strategy and encouraging people living with HIV to engage in and adhere to treatment (Okoli et al., 2021); (2) reducing HIV-related stigma by affirming that people living with HIV, who are virally suppressed, cannot transmit the virus (Ford et al., 2022); (3) empowering individuals living with HIV by emphasising that they have control over their sexual health and can make informed choices without the fear of transmitting the virus to their partners (Calabrese et al., 2021); and (4) influencing public health policies and guidelines worldwide. Many countries and organisations, including UNAIDS, have officially endorsed the U = U message (UNAIDS, 2018, 2020). Despite this, whether or not molecular epidemiology has led to a significant improvement in HIV prevention efforts remains controversial (Mehta et al., 2019).

In terms of public health practice, molecular epidemiology has been used routinely in North America and Europe to identify local patterns of active transmission, which have supported focused HIV prevention programmes and interventions (Bachmann et al., 2021; Brenner et al., 2021; Nguyen et al., 2022; Oster et al., 2021; Poon et al., 2015; Poon et al., 2016; Ragonnet-Cronin et al., 2018; Ragonnet-Cronin et al., 2022; Salazar-Vizcaya et al., 2022; Schneider et al., 2022; Tumpney et al., 2020; Wilbourn et al., 2021). Recently, HIV molecular epidemiology in Eastern and Southern Africa has been thrust into the spotlight. The Kenyan Medical Research Institute (KEMRI) possesses large repositories of mucosal and blood samples, to which a large cadre of international (and mostly Western-based) scientists hold access (Nduva et al., 2022b; Voller et al., 2022). Additionally, a consortium of American, British, and African institutions currently run the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation-funded Phylogenetics And Networks for Generalised Epidemics in Africa (PANGEA) project, which has gathered >30,000 HIV NGS files from Botswana, Kenya, South Africa, Tanzania, Uganda, and Zambia (Fraser et al., 2018; Pillay et al., 2015; Ratmann et al., 2017; Ratmann et al., 2019).

Some findings from PANGEA have begun to emerge. Most notably, in Rakai, Uganda, HIV deep sequencing revealed that transmission between Lake Victoria hotspots and surrounding inland

communities was uncommon (Ratmann et al., 2020). Furthermore, it was found that HIV migration occurred more commonly from inland communities to hotspots surrounding Lake Victoria, contrasting the common belief that hotspots sustain the epidemic inland. This suggests that geographical targeting of HIV prevention would not be effective for broader epidemic control in contrast to the current mantra of focused HIV prevention programmes and interventions in HIV prevalence hotspots (Ratmann et al., 2020). Although the PANGEA-HIV Consortium has recognised the ethical implications in HIV phylogenetic research (Coltart et al., 2018), how communities could be meaningfully empowered to guide the ethical course of these studies and the potential use of the findings has not been documented by this group. In Kenya specifically, the collection and stockpiling of biological samples from research cohorts of people living with HIV has been underway for a number of years (Fowke et al., 1996; Plourde et al., 1992). As members of multidisciplinary research teams at the University of Manitoba, we have been part of several studies engaging these research cohorts (Gebrebrhan et al., 2021; Nduva et al., 2022a; Nduva et al., 2022b; Sivro et al., 2020). Additionally, our team has longstanding relationships and collaborations with community-led activist organisations in Nairobi (Becker et al., 2018; Bhattacharjee et al., 2020; Cheuk et al., 2020; Kimani et al., 2020; Lazarus et al., 2022; Lorway, 2020; Macharia et al., 2020; Ma et al., 2020) and, therefore, is particularly well-situated to both interrogate and attempt to collaboratively adapt current approaches to phylogenetic investigations. Our study is also timely because unlike the heated controversy that has appeared in Western activist circles (Bernard et al., 2020; McClelland et al., 2019), phylogenetic studies in African contexts, despite major developments like the PANGEA project, have mostly flown under the radar of bioethicists and HIV activists alike with a few notable exceptions (Mutenherwa et al., 2019a, 2019b, 2019c; Mutenherwa et al., 2020).

Ethical implications of current phylogenetic research

The ethical implications that underlie these technical advances have culminated in a firestorm of criticism in Western contexts. A recent issue of the *American Journal of Bioethics* recently devoted a special section on HIV molecular epidemiology, raising an array of such criticisms (Guta et al., 2020; Haire, 2020; Mollidrem & Smith, 2020; Mutenherwa et al., 2020; Rennie et al., 2020). In a foundational essay, Mollidrem and Smith (2020) outline the myriad ethical problems presented when molecular data is reported to surveillance systems, taking the example of the United States (Mollidrem & Smith, 2020). In 2018, HIV sequence data for detecting anti-retroviral resistance began being used to identify clusters of people living with HIV using an approach that re-used their personal molecular data without individual consent, so as to establish a new facet of the US national HIV surveillance system (Dawson et al., 2020). In brief, bioethical critiques have been well-documented and focus on the: (1) contribution to intrusive and enhanced surveillance and the inevitable intensified targeting of vulnerable groups (Bernard et al., 2020; Mutenherwa et al., 2020; Sandset, 2020); (2) violation of consent and questions of de-identification with respect to the re-purposing of individuals' biomaterials (Mollidrem & Smith, 2020); (3) potential re-stigmatisation of specific communities, erosion of trust in health systems, and the resultant unwillingness to access services (Dawson et al., 2020; Mutenherwa et al., 2020); and (4) how molecular surveillance could intersect with forms of criminalisation that characterise contemporary policing of HIV transmission in many countries, including Kenya (Bernard et al., 2020; Chung et al., 2019). At the heart of these critiques lie broader social justice concerns for communities who continue to face significant stigmatisation and criminalisation, such as gay, trans, bisexual, and other men who have sex with men, sex workers, immigrants, people who use substances, and people living with HIV. These 'high risk' and often-targeted groups of HIV surveillance and intervention scale-up can be expected to bear the burden of intensified state regulation, control, and punishment (Bernard et al., 2020). Despite these ethical implications, some benefits of HIV molecular epidemiology have been identified by experts in the field, public health officials, and people with lived experiences. However, from the

perspectives of members of key population groups, qualitative research by Shook et al. (2022) has highlighted the importance of integrating community voices into this work in order to expand upon the accessibility and use of molecular data.

Communities as nodes for phylogenetic research

Phylogenetic analyses, methods in computational biology, and the ensuing ethical dilemmas are well-documented in the HIV molecular epidemiology landscape [see for example (McClelland et al., 2019; Molldrem & Smith, 2020; Shook et al., 2022; Worobey et al., 2016; Wymant et al., 2018)], but explicit approaches to community engagement are noticeably absent from the literature despite repeated calls for involvement of people living with HIV (Shook et al., 2022; Trejo & McClelland, 2021; UNAIDS, 2007). Through meaningful collaboration, we intend to pilot a community-driven HIV molecular study in Nairobi, Kenya with gbMSM, MSW, and FSW accessing HIV/STI prevention and treatment programmes at our partner community-based organisations. While we are not directly collaborating with transgender-led organisations, individuals who identify as transgender will also be engaged at these sites. Critical dialogue has begun between gbMSM, MSW, and FSW activists (hereinafter referred to as ‘community activists’), community-based organisations, programme managers, and our multidisciplinary research team, which includes medical anthropologists, social workers, microbiologists, and computational biologists. Our overarching aim is to critically examine, unpack, and contextualise the practical, ethical, and policy implications of the use of molecular epidemiology in public health decision-making by directly engaging community activists living in Nairobi. We aim to answer if and how HIV sequencing data can be ethically used to inform existing HIV programme design and delivery in this context. In contrast to some researchers who have suspended phylogenetic studies after facing concerns from affected communities (Tordoff et al., 2023), we have taken a proactive stance. Explicit approaches attempting to strike a balance between ongoing discussions surrounding the ethical, human rights, and public health aspects of molecular HIV surveillance have yet to be reported in the literature to the best of our knowledge.

The CIPHR Project Protocol

Drawing upon a community-based participatory approach employed by feminist and postcolonial scholars that aims to democratise and decolonise research practices while confronting power imbalances in traditional research hierarchies (Janes, 2015; Keikelame & Swartz, 2019), we will co-produce lay technical summaries of molecular methods and existing data to iteratively explore the possibilities and limitations of using findings from molecular analyses to inform network-based interventions. One of the largest ethical hurdles for exploring wider applications of phylogenetic analysis in HIV prevention is the lack of technical knowledge possessed by the public to fully adjudicate its potential uses and misuses (Molldrem & Smith, 2020). We will attempt to overcome this hurdle by drawing insight from ‘lay expertization’, creating a series of discussion forums in which local community activists can critically apprehend, adjudicate, and reinterpret expert forms of scientific knowledge (Epstein, 1995; Irwin, 2001; Prainsack, 2014). Recognising the time and expertise that communities bring to participatory research approaches, we will pay community activists for their time on the project following standards set by previous research partnerships (Roche et al., 2010). This will take place through a three-phase process:

Discussion forums

The CIPHR Project team will include community activists in the translation of phylogenetic data through an iterative process that takes place via a series of critical discussion workshops. This workshop series will provide the space for community activists to engage in intimate dialogue with

scientists while together enabling them to carefully sift through the key technical concepts and findings from molecular epidemiological studies, drawing out the potential applicability and challenges for ongoing prevention and health services linkage work in Kenya. We will use examples of molecular HIV data from Kenya as case studies. Lay expert knowledge will then be disseminated via presentations and local discussion forums that will afford the larger community of gbMSM, MSW, and FSW in Kenya the opportunity to interrogate and respond to the potential uses of phylogenetic analysis in HIV prevention (Haugerud, 1995; Naanyu et al., 2011). The team will summarise the key concerns, insights, and knowledge translations from previous phases and disseminate these findings in an expanded group discussion forum that brings together community activists, scientists, and health officials, who are well-recognized as allies to sex worker communities. These discussion groups will further critically assess how phylogenetic analysis can be utilised in HIV preventive interventions. The critical feedback generated during these discussion forums will be documented and summarised so that it can shape the development of a community-led HIV molecular pilot study.

Molecular pilot study

Based on our past experience (Becker et al., 2019; Bhattacharjee et al., 2020; Cheuk et al., 2020), we will co-design a community-based HIV study that combines molecular data with community knowledge to identify emergent HIV transmission clusters in a sample of population-dense hot-spots. This study will be initially piloted at a relatively small scale under carefully controlled conditions, which will allow us to swiftly identify and address potential harms resulting from the molecular data. The team will facilitate planning sessions with key leaders from activist, scientist, and health policy communities to work with existing mapping data collected to compose a detailed procedural plan for setting up, running, and pilot testing the community-based programme. We will combine geographic hotspot mapping data, which have revealed places where communities gather, to design a small-scale pilot project for HIV molecular surveillance. We will not be implementing a surveillance programme *per se*, but attempting to better understand how to collect and use HIV sequences for meaningful and practical data for HIV programmes, which in turn can guide community advocacy. While we don't anticipate drawing definitive conclusions on the utility of community-based molecular research, our pilot study will yield detailed information on community engagement processes needed for future testing and scale-up.

Throughout this collaborative endeavour, we will critically assess and identify emergent ethical issues, advantages, and disadvantages of the community-based phylogenetic project. Rather than identify ethical issues in a post-mortem assessment, we aim to conduct a critical ethnography to track ethical issues and other tensions, *in situ*, during our ongoing phylogenetic project and pilot planning. More specifically, we will pursue a "project ethnography" approach that will also draw upon participatory techniques of collecting and analyzing data (Evans & Lambert, 2008). In other words, our approach will remove the problems of surveillance from the abstract world of bioethics and, instead, firmly ground ethical issues in programme contexts as well as in the lived realities of those who rely on programmes for their well-being. Our team will train community researchers to perform "participant observation" and keep ethnographic field notes, in close collaboration with our team's social scientists [see for example: (Baba et al., 2019; Lorway et al., 2011; Lorway et al., 2018; Thomann et al., 2022)]. This will enable us to go beyond what Michelle Brear refers to as "dialogic member checking", as the community is not only consulted with but is integrally a part of the critical ethnographic knowledge production process (Brear, 2019).

Policy development

We will co-develop lay-friendly policy guidelines on how to establish an ethically safer, community-owned, and regulated molecular sequencing database and repository of biomaterials. To achieve our

goal of greater ‘data justice’, of more democratised and de-monopolized control over biodata, we build on approaches developed with Indigenous First Nations leaders. For instance, working in close collaboration with the Māori, the original inhabitants of New Zealand, scientists interested in genetic research developed an important community engagement model that incorporated cultural values, understandings, and practices with respect to specimen collection and overall governance of the project, a model that informed the resultant establishment of a biobank (Beaton et al., 2017). A similarly effective Canadian example comes from the First Nations principles of ownership, control, access, and possession (OCAP[®]), that include a strong component of data ownership for studies that are done with First Nations communities (FNIGC, 2014). We expect our resultant model will stand as a vital exemplar of best practices and standards for ethical molecular sequencing and knowledge mobilisation and translational work occurring throughout Africa, such as the PAN-GEA project. Given the criminalisation that surrounds sex work and especially male sex work, following anti-gay legislation passed in Kenya in May 2019, our wider goal of strengthening community health infrastructures to regulate the flow of molecular data is crucial to achieving the greater vision of data justice (Taylor et al., 2020). The findings from our study will culminate in the co-design and development of the technical report and policy guidelines that will be disseminated at a community forum attended by scientists, policy makers, and community activists (Isac et al., 2021; Lazarus et al., 2021; Lorway et al., 2021).

High risk or high reward?

This ambitious community collaboration has been conceptualised as a study that could unveil high risk or reap high rewards for those involved. After pursuing a collaboration that centres community control and ownership, we may find that HIV phylogenetics would undermine hard-built relationships between local community activists and the scientific community, potentially resulting in its abandonment altogether. Using these techniques to focus on and respond to HIV transmission outbreak clusters, even when mediated by meaningful community engagement processes, might not be feasible in terms of the ethical, political, cultural, and legal disruptions it sets in motion and the vulnerabilities it exposes. However, if we discover a process in which this technique can be used effectively from an HIV preventive and ethical perspective, this process would be the first of its kind to demonstrate the applicability of HIV phylogenetic methods in the context of HIV prevention programmes, with meaningful involvement of participants who stand to benefit most from any tangible outcomes of the research. By democratising HIV molecular epidemiological studies among key populations in Kenya we hope to establish a sense of community ownership and data justice. Ideally these activities should fit within a wider de-stigmatisation of HIV as being more treatable and preventable, such that interventions can be made available to those most in need. This is necessary as HIV incidence decreases, and global HIV funding allocations continue to flat-line or decrease (Kenworthy et al., 2018). Whether a success or failure, understanding the viability of this technique for more precise HIV prevention will produce global guidance to policy makers on the strengths and limitations of its employment.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank all of our community partners on this project – Health Options for Young Men on HIV/AIDS and STIs (HOYMAS), Ishtar MSM, G10 Research Network, Key Population Consortium of Kenya, Bar Hostess Empowerment and Support Programme, Sex Worker Outreach Programme (SWOP), SWOP Ambassadors, and Partners for Health Development in Africa (PHDA).

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

Funding

Supported by the New Frontiers in Research Fund Exploration Grant NFRFE-2020-00986. The funders had no role in study design; in the collection, analysis, and interpretation of data; in the writing of the report; and in the decision to submit the manuscript for publication. Robert Lorway is supported by a Tier 2 Canada Research Chair in Global Intervention Politics and Social Transformation. Sharmistha Mishra is supported by a Tier 2 Canada Research Chair in Mathematical Modeling. Souradet Shaw is supported by a Tier 2 Canada Research Chair in Program Science and Global Public Health.

Ethics approval and consent to participate

Ethical approval will be obtained from the Human Research Ethics Board at the University of Manitoba, Canada and AmREF Health Africa, Kenya for the molecular pilot study. Written informed consent will be obtained from all participants for the behavioural and biological sampling component of this study. All experiments will be carried out in accordance with relevant guidelines and regulations. All experimental protocols will be approved by the relevant ethics research boards ahead of implementing our community-based molecular pilot study.

Author's contributions

LM and RL conceived the study described in this publication. FC, LHT, and LL contributed to writing the initial draft. PM, SG, JM, JW, IK, SO, SW, HA, PM, JA, RK, EJ, PB, JK, PS, AFAM, JBJ, MT, PJM, SS, SM, MLB, and LM reviewed and edited all subsequent versions of the manuscript. FC, LL, PM, JM, PW, PB, SS, MLB, LM, and RL made contributions to the acquisition of financial support leading to this publication. RL provided supervision and critical review of all iterations of the manuscript.

References

- Arnold, C. (2022). Spurred by COVID, public health gets precise. *Nature*, *601*(7891), 18–20. <https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-021-03819-2>
- Baba, M., Green, K., Isac, S., Halliday, J., Ariri-Edafe, J., Ogungbemi, K., Lorway, R., & Blanchard, J. (2019). P717 using ethnography for planning and improving the quality of HIV prevention interventions for female sex workers in Nigeria. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, *95*, A312.
- Bachmann, N., Kusejko, K., Nguyen, H., Chaudron, S. E., Kadelka, C., Turk, T., Böni, J., Perreau, M., Klimkait, T., Yerly, S., Battegay, M., Rauch, A., Ramette, A., Vernazza, P., Bernasconi, E., Cavassini, M., Günthard, H., & Kouyos, R. D. (2021). Phylogenetic cluster analysis identifies virological and behavioral drivers of human immunodeficiency virus transmission in men who have sex with men. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, *72*(12), 2175–2183. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciaa411>
- Beaton, A., Hudson, M., Milne, M., Port, R. V., Russell, K., Smith, B., Toki, V., Uerata, L., Wilcox, P., Bartholomew, K., & Wihongi, H. (2017). Engaging Māori in Biobanking and genomic research: A model for biobanks to guide culturally informed governance, operational, and community engagement activities. *Genetics in Medicine*, *19*(3), 345–351. <https://doi.org/10.1038/gim.2016.111>
- Becker, M. L., Balakireva, O., Pavlova, D., Isac, S., Cheuk, E., Roberts, E., Forget, E., Ma, H., Lazarus, L., Sandstrom, P., Blanchard, J., Mishra, S., Lorway, R., & Pickles, M. (2019). Assessing the influence of conflict on the dynamics of sex work and the HIV and HCV epidemics in Ukraine: Protocol for an observational, ethnographic, and mathematical modeling study. *BMC International Health and Human Rights*, *19*(1), 16. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12914-019-0201-y>
- Becker, M. L., Bhattacharjee, P., Blanchard, J. F., Cheuk, E., Isac, S., Musyoki, H., Gichangi, P., Aral, S., Pickles, M., Sandstrom, P., Ma, H., & Mishra, S. (2018). Vulnerabilities at first sex and their association with lifetime gender-based violence and HIV prevalence among adolescent girls and young women engaged in sex work, transactional sex, and casual sex in Kenya. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes*, *79*(3), 296–304. <https://doi.org/10.1097/QAI.0000000000001826>
- Bernard, E. J., McClelland, A., Cardell, B., Chung, C., Castro-Bojorquez, M., French, M., Hursey, D., Khanna, N., Minalga, M. B., Spieldenner, A., & Strub, S. (2020). We are people, not clusters! *The American Journal of Bioethics*, *20*(10), 1–4. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15265161.2020.1809550>
- Bhattacharjee, P., Isac, S., Musyoki, H., Emmanuel, F., Olango, K., Kuria, S., Ongaro, M. K., Walimbwa, J., Musimbi, J., Mugambi, M., Kaosa, S., Kioko, J., Njraini, M., Melon, M., Onyoni, J., Bartilol, K., Becker, M., Lorway, R., Pickles, M., ... Mishra, S. (2020). HIV prevalence, testing and treatment among men who have sex with men through engagement in virtual sexual networks in Kenya: A cross-sectional bio-behavioural study. *Journal of the International AIDS Society*, *23*(S2), e25516. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jia2.25516>

- Brear, M. (2019). Process and outcomes of a recursive, dialogic member checking approach: A project ethnography. *Qualitative Health Research*, 29(7), 944–957. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732318812448>
- Brenner, B. G., Ibanescu, R.-I., Osman, N., Cuadra-Foy, E., Oliveira, M., Chaillon, A., Stephens, D., Hardy, I., Routy, J.-P., Thomas, R., Baril, J.-G., Leblanc, R., Tremblay, C., & Roger, M. (2021). The role of phylogenetics in unravelling patterns of HIV transmission towards epidemic control: The Quebec experience (2002–2020). *Viruses*, 13(8), 1643. <https://doi.org/10.3390/v13081643>
- Buckeridge, D. L. (2020). Precision, equity, and public health and epidemiology informatics - a scoping review. *Yearbook of Medical Informatics*, 29(1), 226–230. <https://doi.org/10.1055/s-0040-1701989>
- Calabrese, S. K., Mayer, K. H., & Marcus, J. L. (2021). Prioritising pleasure and correcting misinformation in the era of U=U. *The Lancet HIV*, 8(3), e175–e180. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018\(20\)30341-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018(20)30341-6)
- Cheuk, E., Mishra, S., Balakireva, O., Musyoki, H., Isac, S., Pavlova, D., Bhattacharjee, P., Lorway, R., Pickles, M., Ma, H., Gichangi, P., Sandstrom, P., McKinnon, L. R., Lazarus, L., Moses, S., Blanchard, J., & Becker, M. (2020). *Transitions: Novel study methods to understand early HIV risk among adolescent girls and young women in Mombasa, Kenya, and Dnipro, Ukraine. Frontiers in Reproductive Health*, 2, 7. <https://doi.org/10.3389/frph.2020.00007>
- Chung, C., Khanna, N., Cardell, B., Spieldenner, A., Strub, S., McClelland, A., French, M., Gagnon, M., & Guta, A. (2019). Consent and criminalisation concerns over phylogenetic analysis of surveillance data. *The Lancet HIV*, 6(7), e420. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s2352-3018\(19\)30138-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/s2352-3018(19)30138-9)
- Cohen, M. S., Chen, Y. Q., McCauley, M., Gamble, T., Hosseinipour, M. C., Kumarasamy, N., Hakim, J. G., Kumwenda, J., Grinsztajn, B., Pilotto, J. H., Godbole, S. V., Mehendale, S., Chariyalertsak, S., Santos, B. R., Mayer, K. H., Hoffman, I. F., Eshleman, S. H., Piwovar-Manning, E., Wang, L., ... Team, H. S. (2011). Prevention of HIV-1 infection with early antiretroviral therapy. *New England Journal of Medicine*, 365(6), 493–505. <https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa1105243>
- Coltart, C. E. M., Hoppe, A., Parker, M., Dawson, L., Amon, J. J., Simwinga, M., Geller, G., Henderson, G., Laeyendecker, O., Tucker, J. D., Eba, P., Novitsky, V., Vandamme, A.-M., Seeley, J., Dallabetta, G., Harling, G., Grabowski, M. K., Godfrey-Faussett, P., Fraser, C., ... Pillay, D. (2018). Ethical considerations in global HIV phylogenetic research. *The Lancet HIV*, 5, e656–e666. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018\(18\)30134-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018(18)30134-6)
- Dawson, L., Benbow, N., Fletcher, F. E., Kassaye, S., Killelea, A., Latham, S. R., Lee, L. M., Leitner, T., Little, S. J., Mehta, S. R., Martinez, O., Minalga, B., Poon, A., Rennie, S., Sugarman, J., Sweeney, P., Torian, L. V., & Wertheim, J. O. (2020). Addressing ethical challenges in US-based HIV phylogenetic research. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 222(12), 1997–2006. <https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jiaa107>
- Eba, P. M. (2015). The HIV and AIDS tribunal of Kenya: An effective mechanism for the enforcement of HIV-related human rights? *Health and Human Rights*, 2(17), 169–180.
- Epstein, S. (1995). The construction of lay expertise: AIDS activism and the forging of credibility in the reform of clinical trials. *Science, Technology, & Human Values*, 20(4), 408–437. <https://doi.org/10.1177/016224399502000402>
- Evans, C., & Lambert, H. (2008). Implementing community interventions for HIV prevention: Insights from project ethnography. *Social Science & Medicine*, 66(2), 467–478. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2007.08.030>
- FNIGC. (2014). *Ownership, Control, Access and Possession (OCAP): The path to first nations information governance.* https://achh.ca/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/OCAP_FNIGC.pdf
- Ford, O. G., Rufurwadzo, T. G., Richman, B., Green, I., & Alesi, J. (2022). Adopting U = U to end stigma and discrimination. *Journal of the International AIDS Society*, 25(3), e25891. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jia2.25891>
- Fowke, K. R., Nagelkerke, N. J., Kimani, J., Simonsen, J. N., Anzala, A. O., Bwayo, J. J., MacDonald, K. S., Ngugi, E. N., & Plummer, F. A. (1996). Resistance to HIV-1 infection among persistently seronegative prostitutes in Nairobi, Kenya. *The Lancet*, 348(9038), 1347–1351. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(95\)12269-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(95)12269-2)
- Fraser, C., Pillay, D., Grabowski, M. K., & Rambaut, A. (2018). *The PANGEA project: Cohort and data.* Retrieved September 12, 2022, from <https://www.pangea-hiv.org/cohorts-data>
- Gebrebrhan, H., Kambaran, C., Sivo, A., Adhiambo, W., Siele, N., Becker, M. G., Li, J., Choi, S., Mwatelah, R. S., Reyes, N. V., Akolo, M., Njogu, P., Cholette, F., Ho, J., Kim, J., Peterson, S. W., Martin, I., Sandstrom, P., Mehta, S. D., ... McKinnon, L. R. (2021). Rectal microbiota diversity in Kenyan MSM is inversely associated with frequency of receptive anal sex, independent of HIV status. *AIDS*, 35(7), 1091–1101. <https://doi.org/10.1097/QAD.0000000000002829>
- Gnambis, T., & Kaspar, K. (2014). Disclosure of sensitive behaviors across self-administered survey modes: A meta-analysis. *Behavior Research Methods*, 47(4), 1237–1259. <https://doi.org/10.3758/s13428-014-0533-4>
- Guta, A., Gagnon, M., & Philbin, M. M. (2020). Ethical convergence and ethical possibilities: The implications of new materialism for understanding the molecular turn in HIV, the response to COVID-19, and the future of bioethics. *The American Journal of Bioethics*, 20(10), 26–29. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15265161.2020.1806400>
- Haire, B. (2020). Benefit of HIV molecular surveillance is unclear, but risks to prevention norms are clear. *The American Journal of Bioethics*, 20(10), 47–49. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15265161.2020.1806388>
- Han, X., Zhao, B., An, M., Zhong, P., & Shang, H. (2020). Molecular network-based intervention brings us closer to ending the HIV pandemic. *Frontiers of Medicine*, 14(2), 136–148. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11684-020-0756-y>

- Haugerud, A. (1995). *The culture of politics in modern Kenya*. Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781139166690>
- Holmes, E. C. (2009). RNA virus genomics: A world of possibilities. *Journal of Clinical Investigation*, 119(9), 2488–2495. <https://doi.org/10.1172/JCI38050>
- Hoppe, T., McClelland, A., & Pass, K. (2022). Beyond criminalization: Reconsidering HIV criminalization in an era of reform. *Current Opinion in HIV and AIDS*, 17(2), 100–105. <https://doi.org/10.1097/COH.0000000000000715>
- Irwin, A. (2001). Constructing the scientific citizen: Science and democracy in the biosciences. *Public Understanding of Science*, 10(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1088/0963-6625/10/1/301>
- Isac, S., Lorway, R., Pickles, M., Lazarus, L., Prakash, R., Olango, K., Kyana, M., Kuria, S., Kaosa, S., Kioko, J., Kombo, B., Melon, M., Musimbi, J., Mugambi, M., Ngugi, C., Kioko, U., Emmanuel, F., Mishra, S., Becker, M., ... Blanchard, J. (2021). *Community-based HIV self-testing among MSM in Kenya: How does it impact HIV diagnosis and linkage to services?* <http://www.phdaf.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/HIVST-Evidence-brief.pdf>
- Isidro, J., Borges, V., Pinto, M., Sobral, D., Santos, J. D., Nunes, A., Mixão, V., Ferreira, R., Santos, D., Duarte, S., Vieira, L., Borrego, M. J., Nuncio, S., de Carvalho, I. L., Pelerito, A., Cordeiro, R., & Gomes, J. P. (2022). Phylogenomic characterization and signs of microevolution in the 2022 multi-country outbreak of monkeypox virus. *Nature Medicine*, 28(8), 1569–1572. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-022-01907-y>
- Janes, J. E. (2015). Democratic encounters? epistemic privilege, power, and community-based participatory action research. *Action Research*, 14(1), 72–87. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1476750315579129>
- Keikelame, M. J., & Swartz, L. (2019). Decolonising research methodologies: Lessons from a qualitative research project, Cape Town, South Africa. *Global Health Action*, 12(1), 1561175. <https://doi.org/10.1080/16549716.2018.1561175>
- Kenworthy, N., Thomann, M., & Parker, R. (2018). From a global crisis to the ‘end of AIDS’: New epidemics of signification. *Global Public Health*, 13(8), 960–971. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2017.1365373>
- Khoury, M. J., Engelgau, M., Chambers, D. A., & Mensah, G. A. (2018). Beyond public health genomics: Can big data and predictive analytics deliver precision public health? *Public Health Genomics*, 21(5–6), 244–250. <https://doi.org/10.1159/000501465>
- Kimani, J., Adhiambo, J., Kasiba, R., Mwangi, P., Were, V., Mathenge, J., Macharia, P., Cholette, F., Moore, S., Shaw, S., Becker, M., Musyoki, H., Bhattacharjee, P., Moses, S., Fowke, K. R., McKinnon, L. R., & Lorway, R. (2020). The effects of COVID-19 on the health and socio-economic security of sex workers in Nairobi, Kenya: Emerging intersections with HIV. *Global Public Health*, 15(7), 1073–1082. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2020.1770831>
- Lazarus, L., Moyo, Y., Lorway, R., Bhattacharjee, P., Monnin, C., Gafos, M., Musyoki, H., Mugambi, M., Ngugi, C., Masha, R., & Blanchard, J. (2021). *HIV prevention delivery landscape in Kenya: Exploring channels and platforms for delivering prevention products and services to priority populations.* <http://www.phdaf.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/HIV-prevention-delivery-channels-in-Kenya-evidence-brief.pdf>
- Lazarus, L., Prakash, R., Kombo, B. K., Thomann, M., Olango, K., Ongaro, M. K., Kuria, S., Melon, M., Musyoki, H., Shaw, S., Bhattacharjee, P., & Lorway, R. (2022). Understanding socio-sexual networks: Critical consideration for HIVST intervention planning among men who have sex with men in Kenya. *BMC Public Health*, 22(1), 559. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-022-12901-x>
- Lorway, R. (2020). Experimental entanglements: Surveillance science, sex worker activism, and evidentiary politics in Kenya. *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*, 34(3), 398–419. <https://doi.org/10.1111/maq.12593>
- Lorway, R., Hwang, S. D., Reza-Paul, S., Pasha, A., Rahman, S. H., Moses, S., & Blanchard, J. (2011). Sex in the city: Privacy-making practices, spatialized intimacies and the environmental risks of men-who-have-sex-with-men in South India. *Health & Place*, 17(5), 1090–1097. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.healthplace.2011.05.015>
- Lorway, R., Lazarus, L., Chevrier, C., Khan, S., Musyoki, H. K., Mathenge, J., Mwangi, P., Macharia, P., Bhattacharjee, P., Isac, S., Kimani, J., Gaaki, G., Becker, M., Moses, S., & Blanchard, J. (2018). Ecologies of security: On the everyday security tactics of female sex workers in Nairobi, Kenya. *Global Public Health*, 13(12), 1767–1780. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2018.1442487>
- Lorway, R., Moyo, Y., Lazarus, L., Bhattacharjee, P., Musyoki, H., Mugambi, M., Moses, S., Mugambi, C., Gafos, M., Ngugi, C., Masha, R. L., & Blanchard, J. (2021). *HIV prevention delivery landscape in Kenya: Scaling up HIV prevention in Kenya: Understanding the health system strengths and challenges.* <http://www.phdaf.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/Health-systems-in-Kenya-evidence-brief.pdf>
- Ma, H., Wang, L., Gichangi, P., Mochache, V., Manguro, G., Musyoki, H. K., Bhattacharjee, P., Cholette, F., Sandstrom, P., Becker, M. L., & Mishra, S. (2020). Venue-based HIV testing at sex work hotspots to reach adolescent girls and young women living with HIV: A cross-sectional study in Mombasa, Kenya. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes*, 84(5), 470–479. <https://doi.org/10.1097/QAI.0000000000002363>
- Macharia, P., Moore, S., Mathenge, J., Ndunda, E., Lazarus, L., McKinnon, L. R., & Lorway, R. (2020). Sexual health among Kenyan male sex workers in a time of COVID-19. *Health Education Journal*, 80(1), 119–127. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0017896920950774>
- Matetoea-Mohapi, J. M. (2021). Human rights violations and sodomy laws in Africa: A study of the discriminatory laws and inhumane legislation and its impact on the health and safety of the LGBTI community within the criminal justice cluster. *HTS Theologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 77(2), a6915. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i2.6915>

- Mbote, D. K., Nyblade, L., Kemunto, C., Giger, K., Kimani, J., Mingkwan, P., Njuguna, S., Oga, E., & Kraemer, J. D. (2022). Police discrimination, misconduct, and stigmatization of female sex workers in Kenya: Associations with delayed and avoided health care utilization and lower consistent condom use. *Health and Human Rights*, 22(2), 199–212.
- McClelland, A., Guta, A., & Gagnon, M. (2019). The rise of molecular HIV surveillance: Implications on consent and criminalization. *Critical Public Health*, 30(4), 487–493. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09581596.2019.1582755>
- McLaughlin, A., Sereda, P., Brumme, C. J., Brumme, Z. L., Barrios, R., Montaner, J. S. G., & Joy, J. B. (2021). Concordance of HIV transmission risk factors elucidated using viral diversification rate and phylogenetic clustering. *Evolution, Medicine, and Public Health*, 9(1), 338–348. <https://doi.org/10.1093/emph/eoab028>
- Mehta, S. R., Schairer, C., & Little, S. (2019). Ethical issues in HIV phylogenetics and molecular epidemiology. *Current Opinion in HIV and AIDS*, 14(3), 221–226. <https://doi.org/10.1097/COH.0000000000000538>
- Miller, R. L., McLaughlin, A., Liang, R. H., Harding, J., Wong, J., Le, A. Q., Brumme, C. J., Montaner, J. S. G., & Joy, J. B. (2022). Phylogenetic prioritization of HIV-1 transmission clusters with viral lineage-level diversification rates. *Evolution, Medicine, and Public Health*, 10(1), 305–315. <https://doi.org/10.1093/emph/eoac026>
- Molldrem, S., Hussain, M. I., & Smith, A. K. J. (2021). Open science, COVID-19, and the news: Exploring controversies in the circulation of early SARS-CoV-2 genomic epidemiology research. *Global Public Health*, 16(8–9), 1468–1481. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2021.1896766>
- Molldrem, S., & Smith, A. K. J. (2020). Reassessing the ethics of molecular HIV surveillance in the era of cluster detection and response: Toward HIV data justice. *The American Journal of Bioethics*, 20(10), 10–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15265161.2020.1806373>
- Muchangi, J. (2022). *HIV infections among gays are from coast - scientists*. <https://www.the-star.co.ke/news/2022-04-21-hiv-infections-among-gays-are-from-coast-scientists/>
- Mutenherwa, F., Wassenaar, D., & de Oliveira, T. (2020). Adding a voice to the unique ethical considerations in molecular HIV surveillance. *The American Journal of Bioethics*, 20(10), 34–36. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15265161.2020.1806399>
- Mutenherwa, F., Wassenaar, D. R., & de Oliveira, T. (2019a). Ethical issues associated with HIV molecular epidemiology: A qualitative exploratory study using inductive analytic approaches. *BMC Medical Ethics*, 20(1), 67. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12910-019-0403-9>
- Mutenherwa, F., Wassenaar, D. R., & de Oliveira, T. (2019b). Ethical issues associated with HIV phylogenetics in HIV transmission dynamics research: A review of the literature using the Emanuel framework. *Developing World Bioethics*, 19(1), 25–35. <https://doi.org/10.1111/dewb.12191>
- Mutenherwa, F., Wassenaar, D. R., & de Oliveira, T. (2019c). Experts' perspectives on key ethical issues associated with HIV phylogenetics as applied in HIV transmission dynamics research. *Journal of Empirical Research on Human Research Ethics*, 14(1), 61–77. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1556264618809608>
- Naanyu, V., Sidle, J. E., Frankel, R. M., Ayuku, D., Nyandiko, W. M., & Inui, T. S. (2011). Rooting inquiry in tradition: The health Baraza as a tool for social research in Kenya. *Qualitative Health Research*, 21(1), 14–26. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732310367498>
- Nduva, G. M., Nazziwa, J., Hassan, A. S., Sanders, E. J., & Esbjörnsson, J. (2021). The role of phylogenetics in discerning HIV-1 mixing among vulnerable populations and geographic regions in sub-Saharan Africa: A systematic review. *Viruses*, 13(6), 1174. <https://doi.org/10.3390/v13061174>
- Nduva, G. M., Otieno, F., Kimani, J., McKinnon, L. R., Cholette, F., Sandstrom, P., Graham, S. M., Price, M. A., Smith, A. D., Bailey, R. C., Hassan, A. S., Esbjörnsson, J., & Sanders, E. J. (2022a). Phylogeographic assessment reveals geographic sources of HIV-1 dissemination among men who have sex with men in Kenya. *Frontiers in Microbiology*, 13, 843330. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2022.843330>
- Nduva, G. M., Otieno, F., Kimani, J., Wahome, E., McKinnon, L. R., Cholette, F., Majiwa, M., Masika, M., Mutua, G., Anzala, O., Graham, S. M., Gelmon, L., Price, M. A., Smith, A. D., Bailey, R. C., Baele, G., Lemey, P., Hassan, A. S., Sanders, E. J., & Esbjörnsson, J. (2022b). Quantifying rates of HIV-1 flow between risk groups and geographic locations in Kenya: A country-wide phylogenetic study. *Virus Evolution*, 8(1), veac016. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ve/veac016>
- Nguyen, H., Hampel, B., Garcia Nuñez, D., Battagay, M., Hachfeld, A., Bernasconi, E., Calmy, A., Cavassini, M., Vernazza, P., Fellay, J., Rudolph, H., Huber, M., Leuzinger, K., Perreau, M., Scherrer, A., Ramette, A. N., Yerly, S., Günthard, H. F., Kouyos, R. D., & Kusejko, K. (2022). Identifying and characterizing trans women in the Swiss HIV cohort study as an epidemiologically distinct risk group. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, 74(8), 1468–1475. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciab628>
- Okoli, C., Van de Velde, N., Richman, B., Allan, B., Castellanos, E., Young, B., Brough, G., Eremin, A., Corbelli, G. M., Mc Britton, M., Hardy, W. D., & de Los Rios, P. (2021). Undetectable equals untransmittable (U = U): Awareness and associations with health outcomes among people living with HIV in 25 countries. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, 97(1), 18–26. <https://doi.org/10.1136/sextrans-2020-054551>
- Oster, A. M., Panneer, N., Lyss, S. B., McClung, R. P., Watson, M., Saduvala, N., Ocfemia, M. C. B., Linley, L., Switzer, W. M., Wertheim, J. O., Campbell, E., Hernandez, A. L., & France, A. M. (2021). Increasing capacity to detect

- clusters of rapid HIV transmission in varied populations-United States. *Viruses*, 13(4), 577. <https://doi.org/10.3390/v13040577>
- Park, H., Brenner, B., Ibanescu, R.-I., Cox, J., Weiss, K., Klein, M. B., Hardy, I., Narasiah, L., Roger, M., & Kronfli, N. (2021). Phylogenetic clustering among Asylum seekers with new HIV-1 diagnoses in Montreal, QC, Canada. *Viruses*, 13(4), 601. <https://doi.org/10.3390/v13040601>
- Parsitau, D. S. (2021). Law, religion, and the politicization of sexual citizenship in Kenya. *Journal of Law and Religion*, 36(1), 105–129. <https://doi.org/10.1017/jlr.2021.12>
- Pillay, D., Herbeck, J., Cohen, M. S., de Oliveira, T., Fraser, C., Ratmann, O., Leigh Brown, A., & Kellam, P. (2015). PANGEA-HIV: Phylogenetics for generalised epidemics in Africa. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases*, 15(3), 259–261. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099\(15\)70036-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099(15)70036-8)
- Plourde, P. J., Plummer, F. A., Pepin, J., Agoki, E., Moss, G., Ombette, J., Ronald, A. R., Cheang, M., D'Costa, L., & Ndinya-Achola, J. (1992). Human immunodeficiency virus type 1 infection in women attending a sexually transmitted diseases clinic in Kenya. *Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 166(1), 86–92. <https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/166.1.86>
- Poon, A. F. Y., Gustafson, R., Daly, P., Zerr, L., Demlow, S. E., Wong, J., Woods, C. K., Hogg, R. S., Kraiden, M., Moore, D., Kendall, P., Montaner, J. S. G., & Harrigan, P. R. (2016). Near real-time monitoring of HIV transmission hotspots from routine HIV genotyping: An implementation case study. *The Lancet HIV*, 3(5), e231–238. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018\(16\)00046-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018(16)00046-1)
- Poon, A. F. Y., Joy, J. B., Woods, C. K., Shurgold, S., Colley, G., Brumme, C. J., Hogg, R. S., Montaner, J. S. G., & Harrigan, P. R. (2015). The impact of clinical, demographic, and risk factors on rates of HIV transmission: A population-based phylogenetic analysis in British Columbia, Canada. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 211(6), 926–935. <https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jiu560>
- Prainsack, B. (2014). Understanding participation: The ‘citizen science’ of genetics. In B. Prainsack, G. Werner-Felmayer, & G. Schickentanz (Eds.), *Genetics as social practice: Transdisciplinary views on science and culture* (1st ed., pp. 18). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315584300>
- Puller, V., Neher, R., & Albert, J. (2017). Estimating time of HIV-1 infection from next-generation sequence diversity. *PLoS Computational Biology*, 13(10), e1005775. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1005775>
- Ragonnet-Cronin, M., Hayford, C., D'Aquila, R., Ma, F., Ward, C., Benbow, N., & Wertheim, J. O. (2022). Forecasting HIV-1 genetic cluster growth in Illinois, United States. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes*, 89(1), 49–55. <https://doi.org/10.1097/QAI.0000000000002821>
- Ragonnet-Cronin, M., Jackson, C., Bradley-Stewart, A., Aitken, C., McAuley, A., Palmateer, N., Gunson, R., Goldberg, D., Milosevic, C., & Leigh Brown, A. J. (2018). Recent and rapid transmission of HIV among people who inject drugs in Scotland revealed through phylogenetic analysis. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 217(12), 1875–1882. <https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jiy130>
- Rasmussen, S. A., Khoury, M. J., & del Rio, C. (2020). Precision public health as a key tool in the COVID-19 response. *JAMA*, 324(10), 933–934. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.14992>
- Ratmann, O., Grabowski, M. K., Hall, M., Golubchik, T., Wymant, C., Abeler-Dörner, L., Bonsall, D., Hoppe, A., Leigh-Brown, A., de Oliveira, T., Gall, A., Kellam, P., Pillay, D., Kagaayi, J., Kigozi, G., Quinn, T. C., Wawer, M. J., Laeyendecker, O., Serwadda, D., ... Fraser, C. (2019). Inferring HIV-1 transmission networks and sources of epidemic spread in Africa with deep-sequence phylogenetic analysis. *Nature Communications*, 10(1), 1411. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-019-09139-4>
- Ratmann, O., Hodcroft, E. B., Pickles, M., Cori, A., Hall, M., Lycett, S., Colijn, C., Dearlove, B., Didelot, X., Frost, S., Hossain, A. S., Joy, J. B., Kendall, M., Kuhnert, D., Leventhal, G. E., Liang, R., Plazzotta, G., Poon, A. F., Rasmussen, D. A., ... Fraser, C. (2017). Phylogenetic tools for generalized HIV-1 epidemics: Findings from the PANGEA-HIV methods comparison. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 34(1), 185–203. <https://doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msw217>
- Ratmann, O., Kagaayi, J., Hall, M., Golubchik, T., Kigozi, G., Xi, X., Wymant, C., Nakigozi, G., Abeler-Dörner, L., Bonsall, D., Gall, A., Hoppe, A., Kellam, P., Bazaale, J., Kalibbala, S., Laeyendecker, O., Lessler, J., Nalugoda, F., Chang, L. W., ... Fraser, C. (2020). Quantifying HIV transmission flow between high-prevalence hotspots and surrounding communities: A population-based study in Rakai, Uganda. *The Lancet HIV*, 7(3), e173–e183. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018\(19\)30378-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2352-3018(19)30378-9)
- Rennie, S., Sullivan, K., & Dennis, A. (2020). HIV molecular epidemiology: Tool of oppression or empowerment? *The American Journal of Bioethics*, 20(10), 44–47. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15265161.2020.1806392>
- Riley, L. W., & Blanton, R. E. (2018). Advances in molecular epidemiology of infectious diseases: Definitions, approaches, and scope of the field. *Microbiology Spectrum*, 6. <https://doi.org/10.1128/microbiolspec.AME-0001-2018>
- Risher, K., Adams, D., Sithole, B., Ketende, S., Kennedy, C., Mnisi, Z., Mabusa, X., & Baral, S. D. (2013). Sexual stigma and discrimination as barriers to seeking appropriate healthcare among men who have sex with men in Swaziland. *Journal of the International AIDS Society*, 16(Supplement 2), 18715. <https://doi.org/10.7448/IAS.16.3.18715>
- Roche, B., Guta, A., & Flicker, S. (2010). *Peer research in action I: Models of practice*. https://www.wellesleyinstitute.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/02/Models_of_Practice_WEB.pdf

- Rodger, A. J., Cambiano, V., Bruun, T., Vernazza, P., Collins, S., Degen, O., Corbelli, G. M., Estrada, V., Geretti, A. M., Beloukas, A., Raben, D., Coll, P., Antinori, A., Nwokolo, N., Rieger, A., Prins, J. M., Blaxhult, A., Weber, R., Van Eeden, A., ... Group, P. S. (2019). Risk of HIV transmission through condomless sex in serodifferent gay couples with the HIV-positive partner taking suppressive antiretroviral therapy (PARTNER): Final results of a multicentre, prospective, observational study. *The Lancet*, 393(10189), 2428–2438. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(19\)30418-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(19)30418-0)
- Rodger, A. J., Cambiano, V., Bruun, T., Vernazza, P., Collins, S., van Lunzen, J., Corbelli, G. M., Estrada, V., Geretti, A. M., Beloukas, A., Asboe, D., Viciano, P., Gutierrez, F., Clotet, B., Pradier, C., Gerstoft, J., Weber, R., Westling, K., Wandeler, G., ... Group, P. S. (2016). Sexual activity without condoms and risk of HIV transmission in serodifferent couples when the HIV-positive partner is using suppressive antiretroviral therapy. *JAMA*, 316(2), 171–181. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2016.5148>
- Salazar-Vizcaya, L., Kusejko, K., Günthard, H. F., Böni, J., Metzner, K. J., Braun, D. L., Nicca, D., Bernasconi, E., Calmy, A., Darling, K. E. A., Wandeler, G., Kouyos, R. D., & Rauch, A. (2022). An approach to quantifying the interaction between behavioral and transmission clusters. *Viruses*, 14(4), 784. <https://doi.org/10.3390/v14040784>
- Sandset, T. (2020). The ethical and epistemological pitfalls of translating phylogenetic HIV testing: From patient-centered care to surveillance. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 7(1), 19. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-020-0522-4>
- Schneider, J. A., Hayford, C., Hotton, A., Tabidze, I., Wertheim, J. O., Ramani, S., Hallmark, C., Morgan, E., Janulis, P., Khanna, A., Ozik, J., Fujimoto, K., Flores, R., D'Aquila, R., & Benbow, N. (2022). Do partner services linked to molecular clusters yield people with viremia or new HIV? *AIDS*, 36(6), 845–852. <https://doi.org/10.1097/QAD.0000000000003140>
- Shook, A. G., Buskin, S. E., Golden, M., Dombrowski, J. C., Herbeck, J., Lechtenberg, R. J., & Kerani, R. (2022). Community and provider perspectives on molecular HIV surveillance and cluster detection and response for HIV prevention: Qualitative findings from King County, Washington. *Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care*, 33(3), 270–282. <https://doi.org/10.1097/JNC.0000000000000308>
- Sivro, A., Mwatelah, R., Kambaran, C., Gebrebrhan, H., Becker, M. G., Ma, H., Klatt, N. R., Zevin, A. S., King'ola, N., Wambua, S., Gichangi, P., Cheuk, E., McLaren, P. J., Mishra, S., Becker, M., & McKinnon, L. R. (2020). Sex work is associated with increased vaginal microbiome diversity in young women from Mombasa, Kenya. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes*, 85(1), 79–87. <https://doi.org/10.1097/QAI.0000000000002406>
- Taylor, L., Sharma, G., Martin, A., & Jameson, S. (2020). *Data justice and COVID-19: Global perspectives*. Meatspace Press.
- Thomann, M., Kombo, B., Musyoki, H., Masinya, K., Kuria, S., Kyana, M., Musimbi, J., Lazarus, L., Blanchard, J., Bhattacharjee, P., & Lorway, R. (2022). Remaking the technosubject: Kenyan men contextualizing HIV self-testing technologies. *Medical Anthropology*, 41(3), 272–286. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01459740.2022.2027405>
- Tordoff, D. M., Minalga, B., Trejo, A., Shook, A., Kerani, R. P., & Herbeck, J. T. (2023). Lessons learned from community engagement regarding phylodynamic research with molecular HIV surveillance data. *Journal of the International AIDS Society*, 26(Supplement 1), e26111. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jia2.26111>
- Trejo, A., & McClelland, A. (2021). *Molecular HIV surveillance: A global review of human rights implications*. <https://www.hivjusticeworldwide.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/HJWW-MHS-Paper-English-Final.pdf>
- Tumpney, M., John, B., Panneer, N., McClung, R. P., Campbell, E. M., Roosevelt, K., DeMaria, A., Buchacz, K., Switzer, W. M., Lyss, S., & Cranston, K. (2020). Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) outbreak investigation among persons who inject drugs in Massachusetts enhanced by HIV sequence data. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 222(Supplement 5), S259–S267. <https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jiaa053>
- UNAIDS. (2007). *The greater involvement of people living with HIV (GIPA)*. https://data.unaids.org/pub/briefingnote/2007/jc1299_policy_brief_gipa.pdf
- UNAIDS. (2018). *Undetectable = untransmittable: Public health and HIV viral load suppression*. https://www.unaids.org/sites/default/files/media_asset/undetectable-untransmittable_en.pdf
- UNAIDS. (2020). *Joint statement, Ministry of Public Health of Thailand, World Health Organization (WHO), and Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS): People living with HIV with an undetectable viral load cannot transmit HIV sexually*.
- Voller, S., Chitalu, C.-C., Nyondo-Mipando, A. L., Opobo, T., Bangirana, C. A., Thorogood, N., Schellenberg, J., & Chi, P. (2022). “We should be at the table together from the beginning”: Perspectives on partnership from stakeholders at four research institutions in sub-Saharan Africa. *International Journal for Equity in Health*, 21(1), 111. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12939-022-01707-3>
- Wang, X., Wu, Y., Mao, L., Xia, W., Zhang, W., Dai, L., Mehta, S. R., Wertheim, J. O., Dong, X., Zhang, T., Wu, H., & Smith, D. M. (2015). Targeting HIV prevention based on molecular epidemiology among deeply sampled subnetworks of men who have sex with men. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, 61(9), 1462–1468. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/civ526>
- Wanjiru, R., Nyariki, E., Babu, H., Lwongi, I., Liku, J., Jama, Z., Kung'u, M., Ngurukiri, P., Champions, M. F. S., Nyamweya, C., Shah, P., Okumu, M., Weiss, H., Kaul, R., Beattie, T. S., Kimani, J., & Seeley, J. (2022). Beaten

- but not down! exploring resilience among female sex workers (FSWs) in Nairobi, Kenya. *BMC Public Health*, 22 (1), 965. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-022-13387-3>
- Wensing, A. M., Calvez, V., Ceccherini-Silberstein, F., Charpentier, C., Günthard, H., Paredes, R., Shafer, R. W., & Richman, D. D. (2019). 2019 updated of the drug resistance mutations in HIV-1. *Topics in Antiviral Medicine*, 27 (3), 111–121.
- Wilbourn, B., Saafir-Callaway, B., Jair, K., Wertheim, J. O., Laeyendecker, O., Jordan, J. A., Kharfen, M., & Castel, A. (2021). Characterization of HIV risk behaviors and clusters using HIV-transmission cluster engine among a cohort of persons living with HIV in Washington, DC. *AIDS Research and Human Retroviruses*, 37(9), 706–715. <https://doi.org/10.1089/aid.2021.0031>
- Worobey, M., Pekar, J., Larsen, B. B., Nelson, M. I., Hill, V., Joy, J. B., Rambaut, A., Suchard, M. A., Wertheim, J. O., & Lemey, P. (2020). The emergence of SARS-CoV-2 in Europe and North America. *Science*, 370(6516), 564–570. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abc8169>
- Worobey, M., Watts, T. D., McKay, R. A., Suchard, M. A., Granade, T., Teuwen, D. E., Koblin, B. A., Heneine, W., Lemey, P., & Jaffe, H. W. (2016). 1970s and ‘Patient 0’ HIV-1 genomes illuminate early HIV/AIDS History in North America. *Nature*, 539(7627), 98–101. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature19827>
- Wymant, C., Hall, M., Ratmann, O., Bonsall, D., Golubchik, T., de Cesare, M., Gall, A., Cornelissen, M., & Fraser, C. (2018). PHYLOSCANNER: Inferring transmission from within- and between-host pathogen genetic diversity. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 35(3), 719–733. <https://doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msx304>
- Zanini, F., Brodin, J., Thebo, L., Lanz, C., Bratt, G., Albert, J., & Neher, R. A. (2015). Population genomics of intra-patient HIV-1 evolution. *Elife*, 4, e11282. <https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.11282>
- Zhang, Y., Wymant, C., Laeyendecker, O., Grabowski, M. K., Hall, M., Hudelson, S., Piwowar-Manning, E., McCauley, M., Gamble, T., Hosseinipour, M. C., Kumarasamy, N., Hakim, J. G., Kumwenda, J., Mills, L. A., Santos, B. R., Grinsztejn, B., Pilotto, J. H., Chariyalertsak, S., Makhema, J., ... Eshleman, S. H. (2021). Evaluation of phylogenetic methods for inferring the direction of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) transmission: HIV Prevention Trials Network (HPTN) 052. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, 72(1), 30–37. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciz1247>