PCI – March 31st 2016

Manu – lucky to have wealth of expertise and talent – a conversation and get ideas to strengthen US Gov initiative – 2 weeks away from Sec Kerry convening conference on how Internet is key driver for econ growth and should be on agenda of Fin Ministers.

Every country’s national development strategy should incorporate Internet

GCI goal – working together – majority today is Internet in developed countries

Divide is not shrinking between developed and developing countries

What kind of connectivity are they getting? 2G on a good day

All connectivity is not equal

Why are some countries lagging?

Bringing Afghanistan to April 13

Not just money -

Bringing good examples – Colombia Costa Rica, Malaysia, Turkey, Peru – to be good ambassadors

4/14 – Jim Kim co-host with Kerry – all mdb’s and Finance Ministers – connectivity priority for lending and financing.

Bank presidents hear from Min Fin – for Internet as area of focus

Only 1% of World bank lending goes to ICT – disrupt that – show physically to prioritize internet connectivity, build expertise in digital connectivity, integrate connectivity into hard infrastructure (dig once)

Marquee event for IMF/World bank – Spring 2016

Expanding country support – 37 so far signed onto GCI – connectivity principles

Connectivity - SDG’s –

Sec Gen of ITU and Broadband initiative all coming together

IEEE-WB will host for next 5 years to 2020 – bringing tech community together

Ask for today – connectivity approaches – neutral – multi lateral development banks – increase lending, want more PPP around Internet, want more tech capacity for emerging countries. How can we build more cross collaboration – that is easily done.

Tech companies have a lot of influence in DC – you can have global impact working together – and have lasting impact for the whole world – we need to do a better job across technology – thinking strategically to benefit everyone along these lines

Its been an honor to consult with Vint Cerf - hope we can come to agreement on tangible things we can do together – partner

Vint – not wearing Google hat – Internet Pioneer hat

We share a common set of principles that we would like to be true

* affordable whatever econ circumstances
* useful – local content must be developed to provide utility
* reliable – back from Cuba – download to hard drives – “cargasm”
* Safe and secure
* Electricity – solar and wind power, bicycle generators

Level of ingenuity is amazing – desire to be a part of this emerging environment

What are the desirable properties for Internet policy? need to be adapted to local conditions, level of local expertise.

What would drive those policies to be adopted? Understanding incentives is fundamental - if we want them to change we must understand why they do what they do. What can we cause them to invest more in ICT?

What are barriers to shifting incentives?

Be cognizant of momentum in growth of Internet – mobile phone – investment in infrastructure – must accelerate that momentum – any proposal to pursue further internet growth should not erode momentum already there – add to it, not interfere

Internet is layered structure; packets don’t know what they are carrying. Opps. for organizations to contribute to operation of the Internet at different layers. Google goes up and down – fiber to apps, others are horizontal – so many opps. to engage for business – we must not lose diverse ways orgs and individuals can contribute and have incentive to contribute

When it became easy to put info on Internet, and avalanche showed up – hoping it would be useful. So search engines showed up.

So many different ways individuals, govs can participate in making more internet, more useful and more available. Keep in mind all are important because diff incentives for participating – and don’t want to lose any of those incentives – advance growth – given potential regions.

Scott Wey – seize on incentives to broaden reach – in poor countries – repressive regimes – how to overcome disincentives – controlling information and being afraid of what the Internet will bring.

Disincentives for companies – if a monopoly.

Our challenge is to be creative about understanding that disincentive – and figure out if we can provide incentive to gov/company to drive to growth

Competition – a fan, but not persuaded that in all cases competition will work, especially if too small to sustain multiple competitors.

Monopoly behavior requires regulatory oversight.

Find the other reason for those parties to change their mind.

China – public policies eg register domain names – have invested to put 650 million citizens on Internet –

I am patient and persistent – once they have made that investment – that system is not going to go away.

Eventually it will erode their ability to control. They will get more comfortable with Internet

Steve – Cuba – as it opens up – we are seeing some change. Academic sector – very proud of what they have achieved.

Vint – Kcho – 26 years old – good friend of Castro’s 2 MB access and free Wi-Fi – people are there at all hours with mobiles, getting online with the Internet – young people said – contact with relatives – good access to medical information – unexpected consequence of an artist appreciated by the Cuba regime

Gary Fowle – examples when doing free independent spectrum – 2500 increase in taxes on handsets – Cameroon – working with regulators

Vint – I hate auctions – it's a one shot – with open spectrum – billions of $’s got generated

Open spectrum, share it with good technology, unleash with products and applications

Gary F. Regulators can put provisos – but many didn’t know how to do that

Vint – Communication is cash cow

Brooke – most interesting examples are financial services, health solutions – all govs are touching on the services that can be provided. Even more in top down countries. Govs are buying in – make it happen do it quickly

Gary – Subscribe to Vital Wave

Vint – getting everyone connected is my job for last 40 years. Most important is to understand that in pursuing GCI – what steps will have concrete positive results – without this, hard to keep momentum going – people need positive feedback their ideas payoff – we must be thoughtful about what those goals are, and how achievable, so we have early positive outcomes, monitoring what happens especially when investing. Not just about money, its about incentives.

Manu talked about cooperating and collaborating…

Even in the absence- the Internet allows individual incentives and still product the result.

So long as incentives for active parties are there.

Gary – we asked voices of people who have need on the ground – International Connector –

I have been convening – SoCAP – 2500 people; US broadband coalition – 143 orgs helped to craft US broadband strategy

Zeitgeist for a client – to coalesce likeminded for challenges

When there is a growing set of interests – timing is right

Millennials –

Empathy

Got prisoners released

Bicycle racing fundraiser for clean water

Nepal earthquake

Brazil farmers see Great Wall

Find work – fight financial crime

Building apps with aims for social good

Network of friends

Wish for young people

* Safe place for youth
* Find purpose
* Part of larger world
* Affect change

Manifesto people to feel truly free and capable on the Internet

Top of mind –

Beth – affordability promotes access – democratizing access

Breanna – emerging markets for Google access – translator engineers and govs – v important – so regulators

Gary F – SDG goals 4 specific goals – want to bring tech community

Edu, Gender equity, universal and affordable access, means of implementation – ICT is implementer for all goals

Measure them every year, put pressure – show progress

Kristen from Nairobi – priorities – look at how to create models to drive costs way down for access to Internet for middle and lower consumers – enable ubiquitous access

Mary Lou – FB Oculus – co-founding OLPC – changed equation of what Min Ed could do for country – distribute $100 laptops – now $19 tablets – China and India – every kid will have tablet – can we use gov

Scott – VC, was with US AID global poverty – head of investments Omidyar – create opps for people to change lives and improve prosperity for families and society

Greg – fiber at home, first fiber and first 3 G, first Satellite in Africa – want every school in the world connected – becomes community access point. Policy + give Manu something to take back – do something and say “we did it”

Ayman – Qualcomm – worked on R&D communication more efficient – 1000X to increase capacity and speed by this much – not just connectivity and infrastructure – building codes, repressive regime or not.

There is a political component

Wadih – Corning sells 100 million km of fiber every year. 6 months ago, Internet makes us obese. India phones – were connected to Internet – run 12 miles everyday to get to hotspot.

Subhas – WH OSTP – changing mindsets of people who work in gov, Dev banks. Faced resistance and apathy in gov. People don’t understand why it is so important – see it as a luxury – develop everything else first. A lot of developing countries feel like that

Vint – someone told me that refugees ask for Wi-Fi – connectivity is transformative and we must get message across

Larry – Google – access – Africa, India – affordable access – want abundant access- here to support Greg – Infrastructure is a big component of solving access problem – and its expensive – if we can unlock funding sources to bridge gaps – really imp

Chris Weisler - FB connectivity Internet.org 2.5 years ago. Spectrum policy, interacting with govs and ITU – to lead to more pro-connectivity out there. Mid April meetings – main audience is finance ministers – they must come along – to pay for this – this is ideally having head of state next to them – have they bought into the social and econ benefits of connectivity – reality they will opt for the short term revenue gains from auction proceeds, or taxing devices – money is sucked up in fees to enter market instead of broadening connectivity – never cover 70% of rural population

This brain trust can we come up with a systematic way of baking national broadband plans to codify connectivity pre conditions – then MDB can shore up auction revenue and taxes – to take courageous step to get boats rising

Kanan – Google – research co-lead. 8 years ago in Africa – how to solve day to day problems – even back then 400 m phones – a lot done with SMS and voice – amazing payments technology – can achieve a heck of a lot. 2 points – trying to figure out right use cases – who are our customers, what do they get out of it, what is the value we have to offer

Set up an Internet venture fund – for outcomes – drive activities in that way. Tried to really turn on entrepreneurs in Africa in meaningful way to drive eco system themselves so for long term sustainability get off the funding teat

Who is the next billion?

Internet users will come from different spectrum. Extremely poor in rural regions – turning on 1-3 % could change things. Agriculture arena – turn on farmers’ prosperity by leveraging data from day to day farming activities and transfer knowledge across world.

Manu – how wonderful to have all of you April 13-14 – inviting regulators from major markets – would find very valuable – how you personally engage will make a tremendous difference – we need more help in delivering GCI promise – to make this a historic initiative and seize the moment – this must be an industry driven priority

Yael – connectivity lab at FB – rural environments – for April 13-14 – for 1.5 billion – who are they? If economic exercise – focus on cities? Focus on rural? universal needs to be followed thru

Is connectivity binary? Is 2G sufficient? Disparity could be 3-6 orders of magnitude – are there minimums of connectivity we want to achieve?

Research at FB – we believe rural connectivity is extremely hard. Love to see tech convening to et community of interested parties to connect rural (instead of the next toaster)

Nnamdi – access team at Google – affordable abundant access – can use technology to remove barriers to access – providing capability enabling people to do things – can drive policy change – we have seen this – let’s apply that principle in our work

When think of next billion – when they get access they can contribute t solving global problem

We have to use that demand and that intensity to MAKE the internet – diff biz models, what is sustainable different – capitalize on that drive – how do we enable any body who is interested to become a provider. A group, a community could be a provider – we may not be the ones

Paul – affordable access at Microsoft – now in biz dev – turning affordable access from CSR or research to biz

TD white space – 18 spaces – my motivation was regulators – they don’t get it unless you show them. Get permission o show them the benefit, then they can have influence

Innovation – what does it take to bring something new to market

(easier to kill, than to create something that has impact – overcoming all the things that could kill is really difficult)

Impact – small projects – we want to have bigger impact – finance piece is critical

Influence – having it – internal – convincing internally and externally having influence with partners, regulators

Brooke – Vital Wave – implement large scale digital solutions for specific verticals – financial services, health, agri – mostly with govs and aid agencies and foundations

* This approach to building infra thru services – value is easier to demonstrate
* Think about women – empowering thru education and financial services has exponential impact

Monique – CTO Cisco – intersection tech, economics, portfolio – Major point – SDG 5 – gender equality $9 trillion – women based economy – twice GDP india and China combined. People centered Internet – humanistic hacking – think about women in the villages – enable them – they will carry great potential for those economies

John – we have not touched on - devices – 2-inch screen insufficient. Power. Security on our own devices. Most vulnerable – we can’t rely on them to protect themselves. Sustainable and profitable to have broadband access at $5/month including devices. Challenge is how to make it a sustainable business. $150B foreign direct aid for the US. If we harness the info from the people we want to benefit – we can increase value to them and decrease inefficiency. $3.6trillion in gov services – big data analytics could recycle spending – AB testing – Aid based not on polemic but on evidence. Analyze on an hour by hour basis. Viable sustainable humanitarian approach.

Greg – Solution Model bids. More money for specific services. If put bid out for all schools – companies could combine to deliver suite of novel technologies. Wrap all ideas into bid structure.

Steve Denning –

Steve Huter – energized by fab mix of great minds and passionate spirits – NSRC – its people that build and maintain the Internet – everything evolves – to operate the network of networks – sysadmins, engineers and techies – founded by MIT connecting scientists to NSF net – to further science education. Local hands cultivating local expertise is sustainable method. Tech training, assistance with equipment, stimulate local operator groups – helping each other – tech driven – learned thru 120 +countries. listen first to what people on the ground want – their objectives determine our support. More sustainable

Emphasize – GCI conversations – global clearing house for convening MDB banks, foundations, aid agencies to coordinate efforts with academia and civil society – for those asking for assistance – what do they want? How can we channel to create local jobs?

Vint – synthesizing……

Short and long term

1. What should Manu carry back to Dc to encourage for 4/13-14 – given finance ministers and regulators meeting?
2. How do we get universal coverage – environment, incentives for everyone connected? Overcome natural tendency to focus on most profitable segment – that is not OK. Don’t allow ourselves to make it binary – Give me connectivity – when you hear what people have been able to do with practically nothing – its really amazing – don’t be elitist – some connectivity is better than nothing –
3. Use Case –what will make it useful for people coming online for the first time. If there is nothing there for them to encounter – first person who gets a telephone – who to call. How to get content online that is useful? I am not sure we listen enough. We make up applications that are not actually useful. Send email, get on FB, but info they look for can be quite different. What is culturally appropriate? How do we actually listen? How do we get the information – how can they tell us what they are looking for
4. Empowerment and Enabling – true secret of Internet – it is enabling at all levels and at all dimensions – its openness is what created that enabling power – what is it we should seek to enable? Who do we have to persuade? Do they know they can build a piece of the net? Internet was designed if you could build a piece of it – and connect to something – it should work. Healthcare, education… explain that environment that they are in, can enable things to happen – getting message across could be really powerful. How to deliver message – give examples of how enabling can work.

Kristen – closing thoughts – get internet to rural areas – enable govs – take creativity in country to drive internet out. Look at entrepreneurial models – for profit models – want finance to go into these areas – software and app enablement.

Manu – Global Connectivity Corps – to consult with governments – formalize an arrangement – access to govs – provide network that IEEE could be cross industry expertise.

Vint – many countries come to ICANN because didn’t know where else to go – was at mercy of private sector teleco’s maximizing profit – a real desire for advice to get the outcomes they are looking for

Gov investment in infrastructure – Australian example – investing in national backbone – Uganda fiber network – wholesale can be resold by ISP’s. ISP’s get help of backbone – investment that private sector can make to enable others to provide service

Gary 3 breakouts

1. DC meetings - MANU
2. Universal service – a process – GREG
3. Enable and Empower

Nnamdi – does April 14 Convenors – get it?

Manu – we must show them

Vint – wake them up to giant opp to make a difference

Enabling and empowerment breakout

Steve – a lot of awareness and creativity already

How do we listen, respond so people with initiative can grow?

Monique – panel in Abu Dhabi – colleague from Kenya gov – what was very interesting – a vendor “Call me – I can help you” – Pissed us off

“Steve – you are on the ground -you have best practices – we need to capture the patterns”

Nnamdi – what is definition of scale – have worked with Steve in the past – educ networks – get stalled with gov, regulatory – but at individual universities – tell them you can do a 6-month project – get 5 institutions do it on their own, and they together do it faster than admin

Can you repeat this? Handholding, training involvement – we know it works – but how do we take those lessons – what people really want, and give them direction so they can do it themselves – without running into issue – is it scalable?

Gov’s could take years – Uganda waited 5 years for US AID – still not there

Require a lot of tasking

Kannan – are you solving the right problem? If you solve it in a good way, the word will spread.

All we have to work out is to figure out the right problem to solve

I used to think like that – even if you solve it in a very small fashion, with result and impact – mobile payments – people will adapt it to needs

Incentives, use cases,

Rural problem is not hard – mobile payments – thriving where everyone makes money

Steve – saw it – paid it all in mPesa – wired money based on need, incentive and a savvy mobile provider

Now replicated in Tanzania,

Kannan – entrepreneurs had trouble thinking about things that way – people had got so used to handouts – didn’t know how to fish for themselves

Beth – Endeavor – locally lead – we have intentionally avoided gov – help local startups – with mentors.

See ground up initiatives

Mexico – equity eco system is awful – Endeavor helps entrepreneurs raise local funds – taught govs that could create local entrepreneurships – more companies coming abroad

Industry agnostic

Bootstrap already done

Monique – listening in another fashion

Mei Lin – diaspora enlisting untapped power

Nnamdi – re-aspora – it's a critical part – have insights – acquire local knowledge

Kannan – assume there is connectivity and capital available – how to deploy properly

Listen to need in an environment – rural Kenya is different…

How to make sure we are making the best use of what we get – 2G, 3 G, funding at $10k and $100k level

Ways to put it to work in meaningful way

Find problems that are big and small –

Small today, likely to get big – show it has legs

I heard about Endeavor in Africa and Steve?

Steve – Kannan – are we solving the right problem?

How to deploy capital to unleash human potential?

Kannan – when we turned Africa on – Kenyans were keen to better themselves in a meaningful way – improve education, learn about the world

Senegalese – watched a lot of YouTube videos – Google built a lot of caches. Reflects state of economy and the way they thought about connectivity – music was big – re-defined what they did with music.

Kenya – mobile payments first in Africa

Kannan – which 1.5 billion are we talking about?

Decided to focus on health, communication.

Girls were afraid to go to community about diseases – could ask these questions.

Have to listen.

Monique – even though use cases vary country to country – you have a replicable model Examples especially talking about women – lady in Afghanistan – Feris Day – teaches women to code – using block chain for currency – working with Consensus – interesting model for service

I am in the block chain mode – its interesting in itself

People who are under threat – enabling them to apply for jobs, how can we do it in a way that works for them

What happens is they connect to a recommender system – they get a loan under no threat – next level of payment systems

Use cases where there is an inherent desire to communicate, to use infrastructure – need to look at what safety looks

Nnamdi - if you think about problem in traditional supply and demand –

Supply – how do we use people and take advantage of their desire and drive – what is it I need to provide so the person can do it

How do we not do all of it – what do we provide to enable it?

Demand – Sri Lanka – relatively good connectivity, intensity of usage is not as much – different people are at different phases – LISTEN becomes very active

Developer competitions at Google – when they register – you can see the theme show up in countries

Kenya – self help, education

Apps that won demonstrated culture

Look at the meta data coming back and what does it tell us

INTENSITY – not number of users – where is it going – if really bright – it will reward investment

Work on Supply side – DIY franchise, apply money sensibly

Demand side – listen more, ways of understanding what matters – ways to frame what really matters in each area

Cities have worked on centers of excellence –

There may be re-usable principles

Kannan – must use local folks and local talent to do this, not us swooping in

Local entrepreneurs need structure – if they express they don’t have it

Big question – how do we enable people locally to express what they would use connectivity for.

Connecting people - to enable them in the pre-Endeavor mode – figure out key issues

Beth – who are we talking about?

Kannan – young kids, rural communities

Steve – defining audience is key.

Beth – especially for ministers – tell stories that resonate

Nnamdi will they subscribe to one group and not another group. Ministers will not draw the line

Kannan – enable people who really care – make it economically viable

Nnamdi – countries will have a bias – massive youth bulge – aging population

Steve – how do we listen to allow people on the ground to build capability?

Utilize local talent

Provide structure assistance based on their objectives

Defining audience

Increase opps for motivated youth and aging

Avoid digital colonialism

Kannan – well meaning giving money

Monique – have to have power of AND – govs on one side – types of networks – local entrepreneurs – work with people on the ground, Network Academy – 101 countries – completely localized – stimulates and grows skill sets – very important, scaling nicely. Depending on culture- we are learning that certain skills are needed before getting to Network Academy – enough to get folks in the industry – cottage industry

Anna Waldman-Brown – standardized Maker Group.

Steve – best thing is harness gov with top down and bottom up, Skills training

Monique – embed entrepreneurial n gov

Kannan – chase certificates

Nnamdi – see info, driers license – point system – every time you help, your value goes up. Community value delivery – big bonus if you build something.

Report backs

1. Connection between GDP and connectivity – was BCG report –

Think concretely about impact

Cross cutting impact – health, education

1. Commitments – speak about your commitment to bring people online on 4/14

ITU is proposing – monthly progress tracker – get info online – measure progress – will work with industry players

Donor countries

Recipient countries

Want MDB’s to double lending in ICT by 2020 (1% today at World Bank)

Roadmap – where do we go from here?

* All convening’s occur – and identify with precision what to achieve at future meetings

October session

April 13 – World Café in afternoon – Africa, America,

Regulators from regions in attendance – broad cross section – so find out local challenges – what are ways to accelerate

Vint – we may too often regionalize discussions. Have countries compete – we want to highlight countries in each region. Farther ahead countries should work out why that worked?

Akamai has best data

Greg - ITU could aggregate it from tech companies.

Steve – no holistic measurement approach

Vint – draw a world map distorted by level of implementation in each country

Nnamdi – measurement piece is where the gap is. Its not consistent and not complete – so efforts in FB and Google – get to a holistic framework we could accelerate and get behind

Chris – we do a lot of data – lots of companies with data – we will have something much more meaningful – ITU, GSMA, Cisco, Akamai – being discussed at Broadband commission will have read out that ITU will lead among stakeholders

FB – we will try to share more data as soon as we can, and as we can

Population density data

Nnamdi – broadband pricing

Brooke – educating recipient govts on total cost of managing and building infrastructure

Kannan – we are collecting metrics – we are not understanding the data. What is not clear is “what happening” in macro economic way

John – we need to have a lifetime value for residents

Greg’s group

Vint – took Greg’s idea - BFR – big RFP

I have a new career in standup

How to generate a huge amount of interest – dangle a large enough bait industry will WANT to respnd – Bechtel etc will be willing to pull together a variety of responses

Must be real money behind it.

Under WB rules – money is loaned to countries – those loans are paid back –

Not a contract to build something – it's a contract to offer services – have to run it

T&C’s in RFP must incorporate how operated, maintained, costs to operate and roadmap

Lot of concern that we don’t end up with responses with current technology – stimulate ideas for new ways of doing things

Not 2G to 3G to …. Do not have to replicate history

Tactic to et new ideas – get RFI – and ask people to suggest new ways to achieve objective

Regional focus – common problems – Opt in treatment – to organize regionally, but not mandated

Avoid solutions that are nuts

Don’t want old style solutions

Concern – if did RFP with intent of getting everyone connected – could end up with 1 provider – so don’t want to design system that has built into it one provider – want to offer consumer choice. Don’t want to go to monopoly – don’t get put in that track

RFP should include measurement and reporting of what is actually happening – so people can assess quality they are getting – which is validated. Not just the vendor reported

Right incentives – that exercise would be really valuable

Steve – how do we listen assist peple on the ground to provide services in their communities

* Utilize local talent to drive investment in building capability
* Provide structure and assistance based on what is requested and defined by people and their objectives
* Defining audience is key –
* Increasing opps for motivated youth and women entrepreneurs
* Avoid digital colonialism – techno colonialism
* Govs need to be part of the solution – top down and bottom up concurrently – seeding and funding entrepreneurs, networks and universities – govs remove obstacles, provide investment funding to make it happen. Countries figure out the top down, bottom up
* More PPP’s
* Nnamdi – Re-aspora. Eg Vietnamese diaspora went back – powerful untapped resources – bring back knowledge, capital, contacts – help their families. Intellectual remittance

Kannan – are we solving the right problem – once we identify what that is, entrepreneurs will adapt it to their culture and run with it.

We don’t need a grand plan – solving at a small scale,

Respect local aspirations – youth, elderly….

Gary – personal and organizations…..aspirational

Going forward – focus was first to set the table for April 13-14

What can we do together beyond that time?

Broadband coalition – focused on public broadband to get municipalities to talk about similar issues with incumbents – arose need for US Broadband strategy

In 5 months, 143 organizations jumped on US Broadband coalition

Jim Baler – co-founded – worked with municipalities to spread opp of US broadband. Early people – what do we agree we care about

Some lagged as they were ok with things the way they were

Dialogs like this informed people, safe place to discuss strategy for country

3 months after we worked on this, Obama took office and told FCC to get a strategy in 5 months and it became the broadband strategy

It starts from a simple question about what we can do together?

John – enormous complexity – we have to get gong while solving the problem – cost and ROI problem get worse as we go further down the GDP per capita

How do we bring more resources to solve it, build the plane while we are flying

Vint – a couple ways – play the grand challenge game – to set a target

Prizes for a particular target – equipment built for X and last for whenever

RFI is another tactic

We could pick targets that could make a big difference in deployment and affordability

An X prize is amazingly effective.

DARPA challenge in robotics – 1st – everyone failed – people had remarkable sympathy for robots

2nd

Are there specific things we could raise as targets if successfully achieved could make a difference?

John – in the West –disposable income could cover costs. How can we go to IMF?

Vint – Steve’s advice is to listen first. Conundrum – no one asked Jobs to do smart phone. Some cases where listening may not work because they don’t know what’s possible

Steve – ask questions, engage in dialog, what do they think they want

Kannan – cannot think aspirationally till basic issues are solved

Universal access is necessary

An easy metric that we can believe in here’s the input, here’s the output, the impact is clear

Without that…

Nnamdi – the problem behind the problem – the needs they are contending exist

Communication problem is very fundamental

People will face it at their own evolution phase

Assuming we accept idea of how do we focus on what they need to enable them to do what they want to do

Structure for service providers – if this is a model we can replicate – tap into resources – beginner or … can tap into it – to apply

John – do a better job of showcasing exemplars – did X – eg Estonia had typewriters

And went to smart phones

How they created efficiencies – they will go to other govs

Vint – case of Estonia 1.5 million people a number small enough to do it for 100% of population

Interesting exercise to se what happens if you can do it for everyone

While talking about possibilities that they have not lived them – hard to talk about it, even showing doesn’t work

Religious experience – to see packets didn’t drop

However we architect solutions – provide plenty of room to allow people who hit the problem to solve the problem

Think really carefully that we are enabling – whether funding, tech, hardware, apps – mobile phone allows 3rd parties to design a solution to something – this is very valuable – not dependent on maker of phone – retain the 3rd party solution

John – April 13-14 happened

Vint – how do we help govs recognize they can set policies to enable people to empower people?

Beth – Endeavor intentionally avoids gov funding – creating a class of iconic founders

Yael – spectrum auctions – we should suggest policies that will allow bottoms up experimentation

Paul – you are describing an US cultural bias about gov and private sector interaction – spectrum licensed access – gov enabled innovaton – it's the reverse

Post colonial

Vint – examples – would you like to look at this

Beth – we have examples –

Vint – you need to help govs see the story and understand why that worked

Steve – could be clearing obstacles

Beth - we could all be mentors to leaders in government

Greg – Geek Mentor corps

Vint – get out of the way – proud of US gov for initiated Internet project and we are step by step going out of the way

Its now a gigantic bottom up thing

John – get together in May – bring more companies and energy to move further to get this done

# Wrap up thought

Steve – follow up on Brooks comment on capacity building being central tenet – lot of network operator groups – NAN org – we have cultivated South Asian, Pacific, Tanzanian, Rwandan operator group

ISP, research, cross section – let them run their own events – once that takes root – they run their own event – build off African operator group and do national one. Learn from each other

Nnamdi – need to measure better, listen and enable, tell the stories, show the examples, provide geek mentors for Manu *(John – we don’t know how much it costs, what we can make progress in – exemplars, community lifetime value – it's the BANKS – the govts answer to the banks)*

Kannan – we are looking at this problem in he traditional way – public funding, govs – change how we look at solving this problem. Use SV intellect and solve this in a typical private funding model – foundations are abandoning govs as a channel

Greg – create the RP – solve it by 2020 – (wants a $17 b RFI – Ericsson and Telefonica will just solve the current probem – Gary – we have to connect a lot of people – its not SV to do it top down – what are actual mechanics to enabling people to solve this – we have negative consequences, eg the creation of beltway bandits and then subcontract to a lot of people, flood of money that ends up as a fine mist at the bottom – John – most aid benefits the Donor country)

Yael – retweet Kannan – imp to start with convening - too hard a problem – what are set of techniques that can help countries move forward. (John – that’s where its imperative to enable people to get behind a list of stories – you’ve got this, I’ve got this bit, Google doing this, Microsoft doing that)

Chris - +1 capacity building for humans – if this group can come together and get to some level of policy pre conditions that lead to good connectivity, Open access recommendations. (Draft 1 out of this meeting)

Monique – Internet geek advisory function – we should be doing that – nothings stopping us

Internet Mentors for Manu (John – detest word geek – make sure any agency has trusted competent advisors – need someone to say – what’s missing? Does this make sense? Even US gov does not know how to do that. Program that allegedly benefits schools in the US has them paying more than twice what they would get if they were able to buy it – Republicans have mandated that schools cannot negotiate, its procured for them – if they went to a local contractor, they would get a quarter to a tenth of what they are paying. It's a subsidy to pay list price)

Brook – tracking progress – don’t have to measure everything to measure something. Needs to be meaningful *(Gary – there are massive disincentives NOT to be transparent, John – we see countries anxious that they are being left behind. Gary – unless the funding source requires it, John – it's the banks that control this – they will be in favor of transparency – one of the functions is that we have to find a few things to track and find a way to persuade donor agencies that you can get standard funding at LIBOR+8 or if you track xyz, you get LIBOR + 7.5% - at that point, everyone’s sitting up. Banks will get a better return on something being actually done. Gary – historically, Banks don’t do it because its more work. If they ask for the data, they have to do it. Foundations don’t do it because they don't have incentives to do it. John – if work has to be done, but not by them. Gary – show where the data needs to go. John – if kids can crack open it – it needs to be reasonably transparent. Gary – Acumen fund – closed in early 2003 - does with investees – very structured reporting process – quarterly, funding continues based on reports. Jacqueline would have been a great person to have – they are a reference example for efficient use of funds – we need a view of incentives and what it catalyzes. John – they are in NY. Vint picked incentives – need to reinforce this. Microsoft may know more about what Eqygt does and they are not going to share it)*

Paul – great – surprised I’m still here – felt in the company of very smart people - capacity building point is critical – help to solve that problem. (Manu brought him, in Washington. John – MSFT’s experience in 18 field projects – FB done 30 projects – could keep doing, but not do anything – they are not creating a system wide solution – they thought they could solve it themselves – finding out they could not. Realizing they cannot do it alone.)

* Access to capital is so critical – for entrepreneurs in emerging markets (*Gary – figuring out what the mechanism is that is culturally appropriate. Kiva like mechanism. Microfinance was successful even at uxurious prices – loan sharks were charging 400% - social engineering around groups – basic value was reputation capital. Largest challenge in country was mini-finance. Need reputation capital and building that up is really hard. Loaning $500 in Bangladesh is impossible – John –“Poor Economics” from MIT, doing randomized trials in AID, did a thorough dissection of Bangladesh – by pooling loans in a village – do 10 loans in a village, a loan officer could check in on 100 loans a day – brutal efficiency – review a loan portfolio – check in with lender every 2 weeks. Meet with 10 families for half and hour. Gary – Dean Carlan and Dan Arialy – center for Common Sense – going research on base of pyramid. Mei Lin – we could be his intelligence network – Gary knows a lot of people in Omidyar – friends with #2 (Mat) and CFO (Sal) – will grab lunch – what is his portfolio – if we can come up with a thesis for them. Lots of experience with Skolls and Omidyar )*

Could a group like us get around a problem – what IF a moon shot – we want $1/mth 1MB thru put, 10GB for consumers in emerging markets *(Gary – sounds like the X prize – very long process. Concept of prize great – maybe not X prize foundation. Requires big anchor funder)*

Let’s figure it out – come up with a set of solutions and biz models that underlie it (Mei lin – I wonder if we can take it to Gates Foundation – Gary – they are large and bureaucratic organization – what are current goals, could we come out of the blue and suggest this. They have a ton of programs enabling NGO’s. Houria – aren’t they focused on health? Hewlett foundation? Mei Lin – Steve Huter knows them)

Incredible (intellectual) capital here – that's the greatest thing we could do

Suhas – join us WH in solving this problem – this would not have happened without Steve, Vint and everyone here

Most successful initiatives, many start in gov and then owned by groups outside gov

Capacity building – starting connectivity team – presidential innovation fellows – talk directly to companies – and network engineers – instead of contractors 6-7

Host future gatherings at WH?

(Gary – Internet is an example – we are continuing the process.)

Ayman – agree with Yael – must use tech for good. Countries with regimes will not allow people to benefit.

Ignore political aspects – would be a mistake – so much of what we are trying to do, requires gov involvement

Manu – thank you Vint, Steve, John, Gary – this support is immensely valuable – how to leverage this opp. This will continue for a number of years

Steve Wu – convince govs its in their interest, and how to help them do so. Committed to find programs. Mentorship and training like endeavor, finding solution – providers

Leverage the internet – Omidyar will continue to do this. (mei lin – help us help you, help you help us)

Gary Fowlie– bringing solutions from this group as the private sector for means of implementation of SDG’s 4: ed, gender, fin

Breanna – huge problem – lots of pieces of the puzzle – understand how to bring other people to the table, even if we don’t understand the language they are speaking in. Understand capacity building, measurement, what other folks are doing and how they are thinking about it

(get her to work on the language and take what she is dong and provide a neutral setting so others can work on it also)

Beth – Entrepreneurs are like water, they go around barriers – if we set it up, they will solve – use them as levers - WH is doing GES – bringing 700 entrepreneurs – they are going to be the political change and drive it

Use that stage to tell that story (John – add that to Manu’s assertion that we need t inculcate agents of technical change in gov and encourage entrepreneurs outside gov, light the fires watch the fireworks. Gary – great entrepreneurs affect policy, John – govs can’t stop it. John – any Chinese company has communist plants – Jack Ma has managed very well. PRC and US do joint naval exercises so as to avoid ending up in a war. On Chinese vessel – every command in every organization must be approved by the Chinese communist party member – except on captain on boat)

Mary Lou – contraryism – big revolutions – Einstein, Faraday – son of a blacksmith, Gauss, Curie, Fourier – orphaned at 8 years, Newton could not get a job.

(John – she gave a talk – theme was that SV is worse against dominant paradigm, except now accepts tall good looking Indian guys. Outsiders 200 years ago – great work has been done by outliers – people-centered ethos everywhere – dinner with NUS Dean – fostering creativity in Singapore – Mary Lou asked where is the Gay district? Fun district is where people break the rules. Enable outsiders)

Meta spec will be the one solved for – enable the contrarians to do the anti-spec.

John – meta means – above in greek – if you are in a level of disagreement – the best way is to go to the meta level – she was concerned to focusing on RFI movement, X prize idea – objectives are not about bandwidth, they are about bettering the common weal.

Thomas Kuhn – its always the paradigm shift – 1960’s history of social and scientific revolution – John says this is what we are applying here. People (Harvard guy) who know a lot about a problem cannot see the solution. People who have a wealth of analogies – and know a little about the problem – Churchill’s book on leadership – people who affect change are brilliant and know lots of horizontal stories and faced with intractable problems draw on other metaphors.

Vint – thank you Gary

Vint – 4 tweets

1. Focus more on people centricity
2. We need to give users choice
3. There is power in the private sector
4. Enable it

John – providing universal broadband. Ghana difficult, Liberia infeasible – combination of private and public in resolving these is different. No reason why innovative thoughtful creative people can’t go to Peru and set up broadband.

Mei Lin provide a map of the problem

Gary – aggregate their thoughts – mapping was the metaphor – grouped by problem domain, solution domain, where are the gaps

Take inputs, big nexus points, reference examples, where are the holes.

People step back and say “that’s what we are focused on”

First response on seeing the map is – that’s wrong, put me here, then its right.

Paul - How does 1.5 billion get distributed?

Diego Molano – talking about it is one thing – on the ground, you find every solution has a problem.

Education – in coding in using technology, implementing business plans, entrepreneurship

April 13 – help regulators and Fin Ministers – increase lending for ICT, best practices for projects – more discussions –

April 14 – 11 am to 1 pm – Commitment – Internet as key driver for economy – Finance ministers – seize the opportunity for Kerry and Jim Kim

Diego – critical to engage finance ministers – because they are the ones with the money – the Latin America economies are starting a new crisis – most are thinking of tax reforms – using technology to improve taxes – projects like those can have high impact – finance ministers will be very interested. Action – Mei Lin – get examples from Singapore and US

Manu – have the Finance minister tell the Colombia story

high speed Internet everywhere in Colombia – with 1000’s of entrepreneurs developing solutions using local technology